

Asymptotic Analysis of Randomized Quick Select using Generating function

Amitesh Singh
singh.amitesh@gmail.com
Anuj Agarwal
anuj.ism@gmail.com

Abstract

QUICK-SELECT (modelled after the quicksort algorithm) can be used to find the i^{th} order statistics (smallest or largest) out of a set of n elements. It is also known as Hoare's FIND algorithm[7]. In this paper, we represent standard version, where the pivot is chosen from the given input of n elements. Knuth[1] has already calculated the average cost, by elementary method. In this paper, we find the explicit formulae for the average cost by using bivariate generating function and differential equations solving techniques.

1 Introduction

The problem of *select* consists of finding the i^{th} smallest (or i^{th} largest) element out of a given set of n elements. The following pseudo-code for QUICK-SELECT returns the i^{th} smallest element of the array $A[p..r]$, $1 \leq i \leq n$.

```

QUICK-SELECT(A,p,r,i)
if  $p=r$  then
  | then return A[p]
end
q  $\leftarrow$  RANDOMIZED-PARTITION(A,p,r)
k  $\leftarrow$  q-p+1
if  $i = k$  then
  | return A[q]
else if  $i < k$  then
  | return QUICK-SELECT(A,p,q-1,i)
else
  | return QUICK-SELECT(A,q+1,r,i-k)
  
```

Algorithm 1: Randomized Select

2 The Average Cost

Procedure RANDOMIZED-PARTITION is likely to return an element as pivot with probability that we denote by $P_{n,k}$, so we have

$$P_{n,k} = \frac{1}{n} \quad (1)$$

The average cost by QUICK-SELECT on an input array $A[p..r]$ of n elements is a random variable that we denote by $R_{n,i}$.

$$R_{n,i} = n - 1 + C + \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} P_{n,k} R_{n-k,i-k} + \sum_{k=i+1}^n P_{n,k} R_{k-1,i}$$

and $R_{n,i} = R_{n,n+1-i}$ for any i , $1 \leq i \leq n$ where C is the cost involved in finding a pivot.

For convenience, we took $C \approx 0$.

$$R_{n,i} = n - 1 + \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} P_{n,k} R_{n-k,i-k} + \sum_{k=i+1}^n P_{n,k} R_{k-1,i} \quad (2)$$

Lets set up the generating function.

$$R_i(x) = \sum_{n \geq i} R_{n,i} x^n \quad (3)$$

Multiply the equation (2) by $\binom{n}{1} x^{n-1}$ and summing up, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} R_i'(x) &= \sum_{n \geq i} n(n-1) x^{n-1} \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

$$+ \sum_{n \geq i} \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} R_{n-k,i-k} x^{n-1} \quad (5)$$

$$+ \sum_{n \geq i} \sum_{k=i+1}^n R_{k-1,i} x^{n-1} \quad (6)$$

Solving each part separately,
Equation (4)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{n \geq i} n(n-1) x^{n-1} &= \sum_{n \geq 1} n(n-1) x^{n-1} - \sum_{n \geq 1} n(n-1) x^{n-1} \\ &= \frac{2x}{(1-x)^3} - \sum_{k \geq 1} k(k-1) x^{k-1} \end{aligned}$$

Equation (5)

Since,

$$R_{i-k}(x) = \sum_{n-k \geq i-k} R_{n-k,i-k} x^{n-k} \quad [\text{by } 3]$$

$$R_{i-k}(x) = \sum_{n \geq i} R_{n-k,i-k} x^{n-k}$$

Hence,

$$\sum_{n \geq i} \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} R_{n-k,i-k} x^{n-1} = \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} x^{k-1} R_{i-k}(x)$$

Equation (6)

$$\sum_{n \geq i} \sum_{k=i+1}^n R_{k-1,i} x^{n-1} = \sum_{k \geq i+1} R_{k-1,i} x^{k-1} \sum_{n \geq k} x^{n-k}$$

$$= \sum_{k \geq i+1} R_{k-1,i} x^{k-1} \frac{1}{(1-x)} = \frac{R_i(x)}{(1-x)}$$

Hence,

$$R'_i(x) = \frac{2x}{(1-x)^3} - \sum_{k \geq 1}^{i-1} k(k-1) x^{k-1}$$

$$+ \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} x^{k-1} R_{i-k}(x) + \frac{R_i(x)}{(1-x)}$$

This equation is valid for $i \geq 1$ and the initial values are $R_i(0) = 0$.

Lets define the double generating function.

$$R(x, y) := \sum_{i \geq 1} R_i(x) y^i$$

Multiply the equation (7) by y^j and summing up, we obtain

$$\sum_{i \geq 1} R'_i(x) y^i = \frac{2x}{(1-x)^3} \sum_{i \geq 1} y^i$$

$$- \sum_{i \geq 1} \sum_{k \geq 1}^{i-1} k(k-1) x^{k-1} y^i$$

$$+ \sum_{i \geq 1} \sum_{k=1}^{i-1} x^{k-1} R_{i-k}(x) y^i + \frac{1}{(1-x)} \sum_{i \geq 1} R_i(x) y^i$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} R(x, y) = \frac{2xy}{(1-x)^3(1-y)}$$

$$- xy^3 \sum_{k \geq 1} k(k-1)(xy)^{k-2} \sum_{i-k \geq 1} y^{i-k-1}$$

$$+ y \sum_{k \geq 1} (xy)^{k-1} \sum_{i-k \geq 1} R_{i-k}(x) y^{i-k} + \frac{R(x, y)}{(1-x)}$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} R(x, y) = \frac{2xy}{(1-x)^3(1-y)} - \frac{2xy^3}{(1-xy)^3(1-y)}$$

$$\frac{yR(x, y)}{(1-xy)} + \frac{R(x, y)}{(1-x)}$$

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} R(x, y) - R(x, y) \left\{ \frac{y}{(1-xy)} + \frac{1}{(1-x)} \right\}$$

$$= \frac{2xy}{1-y} \left\{ \frac{1}{(1-x)^3} - \frac{y^2}{(1-xy)^3} \right\} \tag{8}$$

with initial conditions $R(0, y) = 0$.

Solving equation (8)

$$R(x, y) =$$

$$2 \left(\frac{xy}{(1-x)(1-y)} + \frac{y}{(1-x)^2(1-xy)} + \frac{y(2y-1) \log(\frac{1}{1-x})}{(1-y)(1-x)(1-xy)} \right)$$

$$+ \frac{(y-2) \log(\frac{1}{1-xy})}{(1-x)(1-y)(1-xy)} + \frac{1}{(1-x)(1-yx)^2} - \frac{(y+1)}{(1-x)(1-xy)} \tag{9}$$

We have to find the coefficient of $[x^n y^i]$ of $R(x, y)$ i.e.

$$R_{n,i} = [x^n y^i] R(x, y)$$

$$[x^n y^i] \frac{yx}{(1-x)(1-xy)} = 1, [x^n y^i] \frac{y}{(1-x)^2(1-xy)} = n-i+2,$$

$$(7) [x^n y^i] \frac{\log(\frac{1}{1-x})}{(1-x)(1-y)(1-xy)} = (n+1)(H_{n+1}-1) - (n-i)(H_{n-i}-1),$$

$$[x^n y^i] \frac{y(2y-1) \log(\frac{1}{1-x})}{(1-x)(1-y)(1-xy)} = (n+1)(H_{n+1}-1) - (n-i+3)H_{n-i+1} - i$$

$$[x^n y^i] \frac{\log(\frac{1}{1-xy})}{(1-x)(1-y)(1-xy)} = (i+1)(H_{i+1}-1),$$

$$[x^n y^i] \frac{(y-2) \log(\frac{1}{1-xy})}{(1-x)(1-y)(1-xy)} = -(i+2)H_i + i$$

$$[x^n y^i] \frac{1}{(1-x)(1-xy)^2} = i+1, [x^n y^i] \frac{1}{(1-x)(1-xy)} = 1$$

We find the well known result. [1]

$$R(x, y) = 2(n+3 + (n+1)H_n - (i+2)H_i - (n-i+3)H_{n-i+1}) \tag{10}$$

where $H_n = \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{1}{k}$ is the n^{th} harmonic number.

3 Summary

We get the running time of Quick Select in average case is $O(n)$ as expected (10). The method of using generating function can be extended to solve quick select recurrence where selection of pivot is done by choosing median of $2t + 1$ elements.

References

- [1] Donald E Knuth, *The Art of Computer Programming - Volume 3, Second Edition*, PEARSON, 2011.
- [2] Ronald L. Graham, Donald E. Knuth, Oren Patashnik, *Concrete Mathematics: A Foundation for Computer Science*, PEARSON, 2011.
- [3] Donald E Knuth, *The Art of Computer Programming - Volume 1, Second Edition*, PEARSON, 2011.
- [4] Robert Sedgewick, Philippe Flajolet, *An Introduction to the Analysis of Algorithms*, PEARSON, 2010.
- [5] Conrado Martinez, *Partial Quicksort*.
- [6] Thomas H. Cormen, C. E. Leiserson, Ronald L. Rivest, Clifford Stein, *Introduction to Algorithms, Second Edition*, PEARSON, 2010.
- [7] C. A. R. Hoare, *Find Algorithm 65*, ACM, 1961.